

PROGRAMME PLANNING EFFICACY AND EFFECTIVENESS OF OFF-THE-JOB PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT FOR TEACHERS IN LAGOS STATE PUBLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS

Emmanuel Babajide Arulogun

Department of Educational Management, University of Lagos
Akoka, Lagos State, Nigeria
E-mail: babajidearulogun@gmail.com

&

Prof. Stephen Adebajo Oyebade

Department of Educational Management, University of Lagos
Akoka, Lagos State, Nigeria
E-mail: soyebade@gmail.com

&

Dr. Akeem A. Adekunle

Department of Educational Management, University of Lagos
Akoka, Lagos State, Nigeria
E-mail: adekunleakeemunilag@gmail.com

Abstract

This study investigated the relationship between programme planning efficacy and effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes for teachers in public secondary schools in Lagos State, Nigeria. A descriptive-correlational research design was adopted. Data were collected from 3,339 teacher attendances and 107 training administrator assignments across 13 programmes using Teacher Development Programme Survey (TDPS) and Programme Planning Efficacy Survey (PPES) measured on a four-point Likert-type scale. The TDPS and PPES were validated through expert review, and their reliability coefficients were 0.81 and 0.89 respectively using Cronbach's alpha method. Data were analysed using descriptive and correlational statistics at 0.05 level of significance. The findings showed that teachers generally perceived the programmes as ineffective (median = 2.0, IQR = 1.0), and training administrators rated planning efficacy as low (median = 2.0, IQR = 1.5). Statistically significant positive relationships were established between all three planning efficacy indices and programme effectiveness: TNA quality ($\rho = .891, p < .001$), programme objectives quality ($\rho = .890, p < .001$), and key stakeholder involvement ($\rho = .876, p < .001$). The study concluded that deficiencies in planning efficacy are systematically associated with lower programme effectiveness. The study recommended among others that the Lagos State Teaching Service Commission (TESCOM) should mandate structured Training Needs Assessments (TNA) for all off-the-job professional development programmes and require documented evidence of TNA utilisation in programme design; and programme planners should adopt Bloom's Taxonomy to formulate clear, measurable learning objectives derived directly from TNA findings.

Keywords: Programme Planning Efficacy, Stakeholder Involvement, Teacher Professional Development, Training Needs Assessment.

Introduction

The role of formal education has evolved to emphasise the development of human capital for national growth, with Nigeria's National Policy on Education positioning education as a key instrument for producing skilled manpower and supporting socio-economic development (Federal Republic of Nigeria (FRN), 2013). Within this framework, professional development (PD) programmes have become essential for equipping teachers with competencies that extend beyond pre-service training.

Off-the-job (OTJ) PD programmes, such as workshops, seminars, and conferences conducted outside the immediate school environment, are widely adopted to enhance teachers' knowledge, skills, and professional practice in response to evolving educational demands (Desimone & Pak, 2017). OTJ PD is widely recognised as a critical lever for improving instructional quality and student outcomes. However, the United Nations Children's Fund (2025) reports highlight the high cost and observed low effectiveness of such programmes, raising concerns about their overall value and impact (Darling-Hammond, Hyler, & Gardner, 2017; Bassey, Bassey, & Asuquo, 2019).

In Lagos State, Nigeria, sustained government investment in OTJ PD programmes is evident, with thousands of teachers recruited and inducted annually (Onodjaj, 2025). This level of investment suggests an expectation of continuous teacher development and system-wide improvement. However, limited empirical evidence exists within the Lagos State context to confirm that these expected outcomes are being achieved. Preliminary observations during OTJ PD sessions for public school teachers in the State reveal recurring concerns among teachers regarding low engagement, limited practical relevance, and weak alignment between training content and classroom realities, indicating issues with the effectiveness of teachers' PD in the State.

PD effectiveness refers to the extent to which training programmes achieve their intended learning outcomes. Drawing on Kirkpatrick's model, training effectiveness is assessed across four levels: reaction, learning, behaviour, and results (Kirkpatrick, 1959). The immediate outcomes captured by the first two levels, reaction and learning, are operationalised through four interrelated indices: learning engagement, perceived relevance, learning satisfaction, and perceived learning achievement. Learning engagement denotes the extent of active participation during training sessions, while perceived relevance reflects how well training content aligns with classroom needs. Learning satisfaction indicates participants' overall evaluation of the training experience, and perceived learning achievement represents self-reported gains in knowledge and practical skills. Together, these indices offer a comprehensive framework for assessing the immediate outcomes of professional development programmes.

Research consistently demonstrates that professional development effectiveness is characterised by several core features. Desimone (2017) proposed a framework identifying five critical features: content focus, active learning, coherence, duration, and collective participation. Similarly, Darling-Hammond, Hyler, and Gardner (2017) synthesised evidence indicating that effective professional development is sustained, content-focused, and incorporates active learning strategies aligned with teachers' needs. Central to these frameworks is the recognition that programme planning efficacy serves as the foundation

upon which successful professional development is built (Guskey, 2024; Kjaer, Bachmann, & Hansen, 2016).

Programme planning efficacy refers to the extent to which professional development programmes are systematically designed to address identified training needs and achieve clearly defined objectives. It is examined through three indices: Training needs assessment (TNA) quality, programme objectives quality, and stakeholder involvement. TNA quality reflects the extent to which training needs are accurately identified and used to inform programme design. Programme objectives quality captures the clarity and alignment of intended learning outcomes, while stakeholder involvement reflects the extent of participation of relevant actors, such as teachers, education administrators and quality assurance agencies, in planning processes. Together, these elements determine how well training programmes are targeted and contextually relevant (Mahara, 2024).

Despite the acknowledged importance of planning, the literature reveals significant gaps in the Nigerian context. Studies indicate that Training Needs Assessment (TNA) is often fragmented or inadequately utilised, which may result in programmes that fail to address authentic classroom needs (Ogba, Ugodulunwa, & Igu, 2020). Programme objectives are frequently poorly formulated or misaligned with identified needs, which may undermine coherence and relevance (Kranjc Horvat et al., 2021). Furthermore, stakeholder involvement remains limited in practice, with teachers, principals, and quality assurance bodies often excluded from meaningful participation in programme design (Olumoyo, 2023; Garba, 2017). These planning deficiencies likely contribute to the ineffectiveness of professional development programmes in the State.

This study therefore investigates the relationship between programme planning efficacy, comprising training needs assessment quality, programme objectives quality, and stakeholder involvement, and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes for public secondary school teachers in Lagos State. By examining these relationships, the study aims to provide empirical evidence that can inform policy and practice, addressing the gap in large-scale quantitative research within this context.

Research Objectives

This study investigated the relationship between programme planning efficacy and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes for teachers in public secondary schools in Lagos State. Specifically, the study sought to:

1. describe the level of effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes as perceived by teachers;
2. describe the level of programme planning efficacy as perceived by training administrators;
3. analyse the relationship between Training Needs Assessment (TNA) quality and professional development effectiveness;
4. examine the relationship between programme objectives quality and professional development effectiveness; and
5. analyse the relationship between key stakeholders' involvement and professional development effectiveness.

Research Questions

To achieve the research objectives, the following research questions were raised:

1. What is the level of effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes as perceived by teachers?
2. What is the level of programme planning efficacy as perceived by training administrators?

Research Hypotheses

Based on the research questions raised, the following null hypotheses were formulated and tested at the .05 level of significance:

1. There is no significant relationship between TNA quality and effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes.
2. There is no significant relationship between programme objectives quality and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes.
3. There is no significant relationship between key stakeholders' involvement and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes.
- 4.

Methodology

This study adopted a descriptive-correlational research design to profile the current state of programme planning efficacy and PD effectiveness and examined the relationships between planning efficacy indices, that is, training needs assessment quality, programme objectives quality, and stakeholder involvement, and PD effectiveness. The target population for this study consisted of 9,800 teacher attendances and 112 training administrator assignments. The sample comprised 3,339 valid teacher responses and 107 training administrator assignments. To obtain this sample, a multi-stage sampling approach was adopted. Using criterion-based sampling, 27 out of 49 sessions (approximately 55%) were selected to ensure representation across different phases of programme delivery: for programmes with five sessions, three were selected (first, middle, and last); for programmes with four sessions, two were selected (first and last); and programmes with a single session were selected in full. Each selected session typically accommodates approximately 200 participants. Using the Yamane (1967) formula at a 95% confidence level and 5% margin of error, a minimum sample of 133 participants per session was derived, producing an estimated minimum sample of 3,591 across the 27 sessions. Within each selected session, systematic random sampling stratified by subject specialisation (Science, Humanities, Business, and Trade Subjects) was used to select teacher participants, yielding 3,339 valid responses (93% of the target). For training administrators, a census approach was adopted, resulting in 107 valid responses out of the targeted 112 assignments. Two instruments, the Teacher Development Programme Survey (TDPS) and the Programme Planning Assessment Survey (PPAS), developed by the researcher, were used for data collection. The TDPS measured teachers' perceptions of programme effectiveness across four indices: learning engagement, perceived relevance, perceived learning achievement, and learning satisfaction. The PPAS measured training administrators' perceptions of planning efficacy across three indices: TNA quality, programme objectives quality, and key stakeholder involvement. Both instruments used a 4-point Likert scale (1 = strongly disagree to 4 = strongly agree). Content validity was established through expert review. Reliability was confirmed through pilot testing, with Cronbach's alpha coefficients for the TDPS effectiveness subscales and the PPAS planning subscales were .81 and .89, both exceeding the acceptable threshold of .70.

Ethical approval was obtained from the University of Lagos Postgraduate School, followed by administrative approval from the Lagos State Teaching Service Commission. Surveys were administered in both digital (Google Forms) and paper formats. Teachers completed the TDPS immediately following their training sessions, while training administrators completed the PPAS distributed after PD sessions. Participation was voluntary, and anonymity was guaranteed and ensured. Data were analysed using SPSS version 25.0. Descriptive statistics, median and interquartile range (IQR), were computed to answer the research questions because the data were on an ordinal scale. To test the three null hypotheses, Spearman's rank-order correlation coefficient was employed at 0.05 level of significance.

Results

Answers to the Research Questions

Research Question One: What is the level of effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes as perceived by teachers?

Table 1:

Descriptive Statistics of Professional Development Effectiveness (N = 3,339)

Index	Median	IQR	Remark
Learning Engagement	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus
Perceived Relevance	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus
Perceived Learning Achievement	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus
Learning Satisfaction	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus
Overall Effectiveness	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus

Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics for the four indices of professional development effectiveness. The overall median for programme effectiveness was 2.0 (IQR = 1.0), corresponding to "disagree" with high consensus among teachers. All four indices recorded medians of 2.0 (disagree): learning engagement, perceived relevance, perceived learning achievement, and learning satisfaction. Therefore, the level of effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes, as perceived by teachers is low (disagree), with high consensus.

Research Question Two: What is the level of programme planning efficacy as perceived by training administrators?

Table 2:

Descriptive Statistics of Programme Planning Efficacy (N = 107)

Index	Median	IQR	Remark
TNA Quality	2.0	1.5	Disagree with moderate consensus
Programme Objectives Quality	2.0	1.5	Disagree with moderate consensus

Key Stakeholder Involvement	2.0	1.0	Disagree with high consensus
Overall Planning Efficacy	2.0	1.5	Disagree with moderate consensus

Table 2 presents the descriptive statistics for the three indices of programme planning efficacy as reported by training administrators. The overall median for programme planning efficacy was 2.0 (IQR = 1.5), corresponding to "Disagree" with moderate consensus. All three indices recorded medians of 2.0 (disagree): TNA quality, programme objectives quality, and key stakeholder involvement. Therefore, the level of programme planning efficacy is low (disagree), with moderate consensus indicating that administrators predominantly disagreed that the planning of these programmes was efficacious across all three indices.

Hypothesis Testing

Hypothesis One (H_{01}): There is no significant relationship between TNA quality and the effectiveness of the off-the-job PD programmes.

Table 3:

Relationship between TNA Quality and OTJ PD Effectiveness

Variables	N	df	ρ (rho)	p-value	Decision
TNA Quality	13	11	.891	< .001	Reject H_{01}
PD Effectiveness					

Significance level (α) = .05 (2-tailed)

Table 3 shows that TNA quality has a very strong positive relationship ($\rho = .891, p < .001$) with programme effectiveness. This indicates that PD programmes with higher TNA quality consistently received higher effectiveness ratings from teachers. Therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected.

Research Hypothesis Two (H_{02}): There is no significant relationship between programme objectives quality and the effectiveness of the off-the-job PD programmes.

Table 4:

Relationship between Programme Objectives Quality and OTJ PD Effectiveness

Variables	N	df	ρ (rho)	p-value	Decision
Programme Objectives Quality	13	11	.890	< .001	Reject H_{02}
PD Effectiveness					

Significance level (α) = .05 (2-tailed)

Table 4 shows that programme objectives quality demonstrated a strong positive relationship with programme effectiveness ($\rho = .890, p < .001$). This indicates that programmes with clearer, more specific, and measurable learning objectives received higher effectiveness ratings from teachers. Therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected.

Research Hypothesis Three (H_{03}): There is no significant relationship between key stakeholders' involvement and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes.

Table 5:

Relationship between Stakeholder Involvement and OTJ PD Effectiveness

Variables	N	df	ρ (rho)	p-value	Decision
Programme Objectives Quality	13	11	.876	< .001	Reject H_{03}
PD Effectiveness					

Significance level (α) = .05 (2-tailed)

Table 5 shows that key stakeholder involvement exhibited a strong positive relationship with programme effectiveness ($\rho = .876$, $p < .001$). This indicates that programmes with greater stakeholder involvement received higher effectiveness ratings from teachers. Therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected.

Discussion

The primary objective of this study was to examine the relationship between programme planning efficacy and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes for public secondary school teachers in Lagos State. The first objective sought to describe the level of effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes as perceived by teachers. The findings showed that teachers generally perceived the programmes as ineffective, with a median effectiveness score of 2.0 (Disagree) across all four indices of learning engagement, perceived relevance, perceived learning achievement, and learning satisfaction. This aligns with Ji (2023), who observed that while participation in teacher professional development is often high, meaningful engagement remains limited. Adebayo and Sulaimon (2024) similarly suggest that participation in Nigeria is frequently compliance-driven rather than intrinsically motivated. The consistently low ratings across all four indices indicate that the programmes, in their current form, are not achieving their intended outcomes.

The second objective sought to describe the level of programme planning efficacy as perceived by training administrators. The findings showed that training administrators rated planning efficacy as low across all three indices, with an overall median of 2.0 (Disagree). This finding is consistent with prior studies (Ogba, Ugodulunwa, & Igu, 2020; Arogundade et al., 2019) indicating that Training Needs Assessment (TNA) is often fragmented or inadequately utilised, resulting in programmes that fail to address authentic classroom needs. The low rating of stakeholder involvement is supported by Olumoyo (2023) and Garba (2017), who found that participatory planning remains limited in practice, with teachers, principals, and quality assurance bodies often excluded from meaningful participation in programme planning.

The third objective sought to analyse the relationship between TNA quality and professional development effectiveness. The study established a very strong, positive, and statistically significant relationship between TNA quality and programme effectiveness ($q = .891$, $p < .001$). This aligns with Markaki, Malhotra, Billings, and Theus (2021), who concluded that TNA facilitates the prioritisation and allocation of limited educational resources based on identified needs, leading to more targeted and effective professional development. The finding also corroborates Oo Zin, Alonzo, and Davison (2023), who demonstrated that needs-based programmes significantly improve teacher learning outcomes. When TNA is conducted with

rigour and its findings are actively utilised, programmes are purpose-built to address real competency gaps, increasing their relevance and perceived effectiveness.

The fourth objective sought to analyse the relationship between programme objectives quality and professional development effectiveness. The study demonstrated a strong, positive, and statistically significant relationship between programme objectives quality and effectiveness ($\rho = .890$, $p < .001$). This is consistent with Devi and Shaik (2012), who argued that training objectives formulated based on needs analysis serve as benchmarks against which outcomes should be measured. The finding also aligns with Kranjc Horvat et al. (2022), whose Delphi study showed that well-defined, consensually validated learning goals are essential for effective professional development. When learning objectives are clearly articulated and derived from TNA findings, they provide a coherent framework for programme design and evaluation.

The fifth objective sought to analyse the relationship between key stakeholders' involvement and professional development effectiveness. The study exhibited a strong, positive, and statistically significant relationship between stakeholder involvement and effectiveness ($\rho = .876$, $p < .001$). This finding is supported by Asuquo et al. (2023), who demonstrated that effective training programmes depend on inclusive opinions and shared views among relevant stakeholders. When stakeholders are meaningfully involved, programmes benefit from diverse perspectives and gain buy-in from those who will ultimately implement the learning.

Conclusion

This study investigated the relationship between programme planning efficacy and the effectiveness of off-the-job professional development programmes for public secondary school teachers in Lagos State, Nigeria. Teachers perceived the programmes as ineffective across all measured dimensions of learning engagement, perceived relevance, perceived learning achievement, and learning satisfaction. Training administrators similarly rated planning efficacy as low across all three indices: TNA quality, programme objectives quality, and key stakeholder involvement. This study established strong, positive, and statistically significant relationships between each planning efficacy index and programme effectiveness. TNA quality ($\rho = .891$), programme objectives quality ($\rho = .890$), and stakeholder involvement ($\rho = .876$) all showed strong correlations with effectiveness, confirming that rigorous needs assessment, clear learning objectives, and meaningful stakeholder engagement are critical for programme success. The study concludes that improving planning efficacy, particularly TNA quality, objective formulation using Bloom's Taxonomy and stakeholder involvement, are necessary preconditions for enhancing programme effectiveness. Without addressing these foundational deficiencies, training initiatives will likely continue to fall short of their intended outcomes, representing a sustained loss of financial and institutional resources.

Recommendations

Based on the findings and conclusions of this study, the following recommendations are offered:

1. Lagos State Teaching Service Commission (TESCOM) should conduct a comprehensive review of the current professional development model. This review should identify systemic weaknesses in programme design and delivery, with particular attention to why

- teachers consistently report low engagement, low relevance, minimal learning gains, and poor satisfaction.
2. TESCOM should establish a mandatory planning quality assurance framework. This framework should require documented evidence of training needs assessment conduct and utilisation, clearly articulated learning objectives derived from TNA findings, and formal records of stakeholder consultation before any programme is approved for implementation. A standardised planning template should be adopted that maps each programme component back to specific identified needs.
 3. TESCOM should mandate a structured, multi-method training needs assessment as a non-negotiable prerequisite for any off-the-job professional development programme.
 4. The programme planners adopt Bloom's Taxonomy as a standard framework for articulating PD programme objectives. Each objective must be specific, measurable, derived directly from TNA findings, and matched to the appropriate domain of learning (cognitive, affective, or psychomotor). Also, planners should ensure that objectives progress from lower-order to higher-order thinking where appropriate and that they serve as clear benchmarks against which programme outcomes can be evaluated.
 5. TESCOM should establish formal stakeholder engagement protocols mandating structured consultation with teachers, principals, education district offices, and the Office of Education Quality Assurance at each stage of the planning process.

References

- Adebayo, A. A., & Sulaimon, J. T. (2024). *Challenges and prospects of teachers' continuous professional development in 21st-century Nigeria: A systematic literature review*. Available online at <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/383740397>
- Arogundade, L., Akinwumi, T., Molemodile, S., Nwaononiwu, E., Ezika, J., Yau, I., & Wonodi, C. (2019). Lessons from a training needs assessment to strengthen the capacity of routine immunisation service providers in Nigeria. *BioMed Central Health Services Research*, 19(1), 664 -672. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-019-4514-2>
- Asuquo, M. E., Owan, V. J., Ekpenyong, J. A., Undie, S. B., Mbon, U. F., Anagbogu, G. E., & Ategwu, P. O. (2023). Evaluation of teachers' training and development programmes in secondary schools: Administrators' and teachers' perceptions. *Nurture*, 17(3), 208–222. <https://doi.org/10.55951/nurture.v17i3.311>
- Bassey, E. I., Bassey, N. E., & Asuquo, O. M. (2019). Staff training and development, its impacts on employees' performance and organisational productivity in Nigeria: A study of Akwa Ibom State Ministry of Finance (2000-2018). *International Journal of Business Management and Economic Review*, 2(4), 155–173. <https://doi.org/10.35409/ijbmer.2019.2413>
- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., & Gardner, M. (2017). *Effective Teacher Professional Development*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute. Available online at <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED606743.pdf>
- Devi, R. V., & Shaik, N. (2012). Evaluating training & development effectiveness – A measurement model. *Asian Journal of Management Research*, 2(1), 722–735.
- Desimone, L. M., & Pak, K. (2017). Instructional coaching as high-quality professional development. *Theory into Practice*, 56(1), 3–12.
- Federal Republic of Nigeria (2013). *National policy on education* (6th ed.). Lagos: NERDC.
- Garba, I. A. R. (2017). Assessment of stakeholders' role performance in the management of public primary schools in Zamfara State, Nigeria. *Theory into Practice*, 23(1), 3–10.

- Guskey, T. R. (2024). Look beyond the satisfaction survey: A framework to evaluate results of professional learning. *The Learning Professional*, 45(1), 28–33.
- Ji, Y. (2023). Factors affecting teachers' engagement in continuing professional development. *European Proceedings of Social and Behavioural Sciences*, 12(23), 1-19.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L. (1959). Techniques for evaluating training programmes. *Journal of the American Society of Training Directors*, 13(3), 21-26.
- Kjaer, N. K., Vedsted, M., & Høpner, J. (2016). A new comprehensive model for continuous professional development. *European Journal of General Practice*, 23(1), 20–26.
- Kranjc Horvat, A., Wiener, J., Schmeling, S., & Borowski, A. (2021). Learning goals of professional development programmes at science research institutions: A Delphi study with different stakeholder groups. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 33(1), 1–23.
- Lee, H. J. (2005). Developing a professional development programme model based on teachers' needs. *Professional Educator*, 27(7), 39–49. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ728480>
- Mahara, K. K. (2024). Receiving and implementing in-service teacher training programmes: Identifying challenges from teachers' perspectives. *Kailali Multiple Campus Journal*, 6(1), 153–175.
- Markaki, A., Malhotra, S., Billings, R., & Theus, L. (2021). Training needs assessment: Tool utilisation and global impact. *BioMed Central Medical Education*, 21(1), 310-325. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-021-02748-y>
- Ogba, F., Ugodulunwa, C., & Igu, N. (2020). Assessment of training needs of teachers and administrators for effective inclusive education delivery in secondary schools in South East Nigeria. *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation*, 15(1), 72-91.
- Onodjae, E. (2025, July 15). *Lagos inducts 1,500 newly recruited teachers*. Available online at <https://www.vanguardngr.com/2025/07/lagos-inducts-1500-newly-recruited-teachers/>
- Olumoyo, A. E. (2023). The roles of stakeholders in enhancing primary education in Nigeria. *Journal of Emerging Technologies and Innovative Research (JETIR)*, 10(1), 177-184.
- Oo Zin, C., Alonzo, D., & Davison, C. (2023). Using a needs-based professional development programme to enhance pre-service teacher assessment for learning literacy. *International Journal of Instruction*, 16(1), 781–800.